

AIDE MEMOIRE
MEETING ON THE WHALES EVENT in ANTISOHIHY – la LOZA BAY

Date: June 12 , 2008 – 9:00 a.m

Location: Conference room MINENVEFT Tsimbazaza

Attendees: Following entities are represented

- **MINENVEFT** Ministry of Environment, Water & Forest and Tourism : Directeur de Cabinet
- **MAEP:** Ministry of Agriculture, Livestock and Fisheries: Conseiller Technique: Song Chan Marcel
- **MEM** Ministry of Energy and Mines: Directeur des Hydrocarbures
- **ONE:** DG, USPP, UEIE, SF
- **ANGAP:** DG
- **OMNIS :** DH
- **NGO's:** WWF (2) , FANAMBY, WCS,
- **ExxonMobil:** DG, Esso Paris Public Affairs & Environment Consultant

Situation

1. In total : 58 whales died, 15 alive found in the lake
2. According to Herilala , WCS:
 - 1 died dolphin found in a very bad shape,
 - 1 recently died animal (which will be very helpful for necropsies
 - 8 dolphins alive arrived at Antstohihy harbour ,
 - 15 put in the lake Andamoty
 - Inquiry from local communities confirmed the first animals were found on May 31, 2008
 - On June 11, 2 boats only were working to push dolphins to the lake. Need assistance by zodiac.
3. EXPERTS AGENDA while back in Antananarivo on Friday June 13, 2008:
 - 3:00 p.m : flight departure from Antsohihy
 - 5:00 p.m : arrival in Ivato
 - 5:30 p.m : debriefing with the Ministry in charge of Environment during which Sofia region and local communities would be represented. These representatives will fly back along with 7 Experts. There should be a conference with international and national Press.
 - Flight back to the USA : Friday June 13 (around midnight)
 - A report (written) relating all activities conducted on site and their observations/ findings.
 - is expected from Experts and should be provided before they leave Madagascar.
4. WHAT DO WE EXPECT FROM EXPERTS: Herilala made the point: they will report on their mission as per Two groups (rescue and investigation)
5. SAMPLES: to export, need authorization from Madagascar Government (so which department?): for aliquot samples, it could be related to Research department, otherwise, need Veterinary certificate. The adhoc Committee will write a letter to the Ministry in charge of Environment. All required authorization for export are ready.
6. ANALYSIS RESULTS :
 - Herilala made the point : no interpretation from the Experts, A scientific committee will be created in Madagascar and will work on behalf of Madagascar Government to explain why the grounding and what is the cause. Didier (from Exxon Mobil) suggested that ExxonMobil Expert should be member of this interpretation expert's pool. The hanging question is: *have Madagascar competent experts to make interpretation?* ANGAP standpoint: since Madagascar called international Experts, we need their interpretation as well; anyway, the analysis Lab will provide and give us their preliminary interpretation. We should remember there is a matter of a specific expertise. We have to learn from this event. Herilala pointed out it is not to fiddle with all data but it is just to make official.
 - FANAMBY keep saying the public expect to get informed of why dolphins are died and to know whether seismic are event generating ExxonMobil has to state on.

- *Question : what happen when we get the results?:* Herilala WCS explained: there are two types of investigation, one is scientific and one is the police investigation of which findings will give more. The investigation should consider three parameters: behavior, necropsies analysis and analysis done by ExxonMobil along with oceanographic conditions during 2-3 days before the event. There is a need to find out a convergence of elements from the two field (scientific and police). The results should come from a more objective and complete interpretation. It could be the detailed results are not expected for months (which is the case of Great Britain?...).
- Then a multidisciplinary committee has to clear the results and state on what is the cause. There is a standard International procedure to handle information related to these samples so, the Government has to clear everything. The scientific committee has to do the investigation and the work and Madagascar Government has to release information. *Question: is it a suggestion or a decision made by who?*

7. COMMUNICATION:

- FANAMBY: ExxonMobil jointly with Madagascar Government has to release information and let us know what ExxonMobil position is. FANAMBY does not agree to join JIC, in their opinion, the adhoc committee has disclosed first the information so JIC has to join the adhoc not the opposite. Remember mammals are died in massive number in a coincidence with oil activities in the same area, so what do we want more? Anyway ExxonMobil operations are on cause assumption.
- Is it important to create a Joint Information Center JIC: Herilala WCS explains: We (Herilala and WCS) made reportage of this event in order to report the facts , since we worked to find out the cause, everything should come from Madagascar itself. No communication should be released without clearance of this adhoc Committee. The two first releases are just factual but no photo no emission was released without Government authorization.
- Prudence is much more important to handle information. WHEN WILL THE GOVERNMENT COMMUNICATE? It is urgent to stop all speculative information. Need to explain the facts and the next phases till we receive results.
- If we agree to join the JIC then we have to clear information then communicate.
- No experts have rights to communicate / release any information: the main concern is they are individual expert, wit no contract signed so far.
 - Option 1: communicate early and easily
 - Option 2: after debriefing wit Experts but WHAT TO COMMUNICATE???
 - Option 3: after receiving results and with JIC provided that any release has to be cleared by the Government. *Question: is JIC the best route to communicate?*

JIC is a system to preserve all concerned Parties, Madagascar.

Madagascar needs ExxonMobil to forward in the investigation but Madagascar has a risk to be linked to the suspected event generating entity. *Question: Have Madagascar interest to join JIC or not?* The Government has to decide on basis of all information we need to convey to them.

Anyway JIC has to be led by Madagascar Government and the cooperation should be done under a precise SOW (or TOR).

8. IS EXXONMOBIL AUTHORIZED TO PARTICIPATE TO THE INVESTIGATION? Didier reply: ExxonMobil has to participate; we also are looking for explanation. WCS: no doubt that ExxonMobil could participate to the investigation now we need to state whether ExxonMobil does adhere to Government communication or not? FANAMBY: ExxonMobil is asked to not disclose contradictory information. It is not the case but could be the case later on (Herilala said). Next time it is important to talk about ExxonMobil participation to the adhoc committee, contribution to financial assistance to rescue operations and investigation and ExxonMobil offshore activities as well.